| **Student Name:** Lilianna Poon |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house believes that military conscription is illegitimate |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 3 minutes’ long due to prep errors!]  We still need a hook in a shortened speech, Lilianna!  On people’s lives being the top priority, we need to actively WEIGH which is more important in the debate.   * Explain precisely what these national security risks are and why there’s no other military alternatives towards solving the loss of national security.   On the trauma that people suffer from:   * Rather than saying it’s just a few years, actively insert some safeguards to explain that the military isn’t a s traumatic as they claim. * Explain that most conscripts are only ever in training and they are not actually sent to war. So a lot of Prop’s harms do not come to fruition. * We can also differentiate them according to abilities and suitability, so not everyone is sent to the frontlines.   Good response to the POI that no other rights can exist without national security.  We need an active rebuttal against the loss of time and youth. Point out that a lot of conscripts still have a significant time to enjoy their youth and pursue the future they wanted.   * We can also point out that military training can be an ASSET, since they can serve as a launching pad for their future careers. Their skill sets also benefit from this experience. * More strategically, weigh this opportunity cost to the one suffered by national security before going into your point. * We also needed a rebuttal to address all of the individual harms to soldiers if they do get sent to war. Mitigate the harms they suffer from. Point out that the state doesn’t conscript soldiers with the intention of them dying, it’s for them to survive.   On your argument:   * Explain why the state loses its authority if they are not capable of protecting national security. * Conclude precisely that this is a legitimate use of force, explain clearly that national security is ALWAYS a reflection of what the general will is. Then use this specifically as the rebuttal to the loss of personal autonomy.   + Explain the balance of human costs and point out why national security is a gateway right in which everyone else’s right to life is contingent on. * Spend more time explaining the security risks, you need some kind of grounding.   + Explain precisely what these dire national security risks are. Use the examples we discussed.   + Why can’t the state explore the military alternatives that Proposition highlighted? Explain that if the state lacks resources, we cannot afford to offer these great benefits to increase voluntary enrollment.   Please offer more POIs today!  3.17 | | | | | | |